



West
Yorkshire
Combined
Authority

Tracy
Brabin
Mayor of
West Yorkshire

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CLIMATE, ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE
HELD ON TUESDAY, 24 OCTOBER 2023 AT COMMITTEE ROOM 1,
WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

Present:

Councillor Jane Scullion (Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Sarah Ferriby	Bradford Council
Councillor Scott Patient	Calderdale Council
Councillor Katie Dye	Leeds City Council
Councillor Jack Hemingway	Wakefield Council
Councillor Jenny Kent	York Council
John Clark	Private Sector Representative
David Owumi	Private Sector Representative
Gideon Richards	Private Sector Representative
Adam Ashman	Advisory Representative (Yorkshire Water)
Martyn Broadest	Advisory Representative (West Yorkshire Housing Partnership)
Jim Cardwell	Advisory Representative (Northern Powergrid)
Neil Whalley	Advisory Representative (Northern Gas Networks)

In attendance:

Liz Hunter (Director)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Oliver Harmar (Chief Operating Officer)	Natural England
Sara Brook	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Tamsin Constable	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Paul Duncan (Yorkshire Area Deputy Director)	Natural England
Alison Gillespie	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Peter Glover	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Myles Larrington	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Nadia McPherson	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
James Nutter	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Ariba Rashid	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Stacey White	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Kevin Unwin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Andrew Cooper (Kirklees Council), Private Sector Representatives, Richard Goodfellow and Leah Stuart, and Advisory Representatives, Jenny Cooke (The Environment Agency), Gregg Dodd (Northern Gas Networks) and Ian Holmes (NHS West Yorkshire Integrated Care Board).

Neil Whalley attended the meeting as the Advisory Representative from Northern Gas Networks in place of Greg Dodd.

2. Declaration of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

Gideon Richards declared an interest in Item 8 in relation to the South Pennines Park as his wife is a trustee of River Holme Connections.

3. Exempt Information - Possible Exclusion of the Press and Public

There were no agenda items that required the exclusion of the public and press.

4. Minutes of the Meeting held on 11 July 2023

Members noted that Item 12 of the Draft Minutes of the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee held on 11 July 2023 contained an inaccurate reference to the work of Dr Alan Palmer, when this should have referenced Dr Andy Palmer.

The Governance Services Officer had noted these comments and the record had been corrected accordingly.

Resolved: That the Minutes of the meeting of Climate, Energy and Environment Committee held on 11 July 2023 were approved.

5. Chair's Update

The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming Jenny Cooke, the Advisory Representative from The Environment Agency to the meeting. The Chair noted that it would have been Jenny Cooke's first meeting, but she had given her apologies. The Chair also welcomed Adam Ashman, the Advisory Representative from Yorkshire Water, who had also joined the Committee.

The Chair noted that, following recent inclement weather, the Calderdale district had come dangerously close to potentially catastrophic flooding after experiencing heavy rain. The Chair was happy to report that, despite some homes in the east of the borough experiencing excessive flooding, in overall terms, Calderdale had a near miss thanks to the diligent efforts of numerous environmental and flooding agencies and the excellent preparatory work. The Chair pointed out that Calderdale inhabitants experience the climate emergency firsthand every year, therefore it is not just an abstract concept to them. The Chair emphasised that such examples of the increasingly variable climate demonstrate why the Committee's work is so important.

Regarding the Committee's work in progress, the Chair noted that the Combined Authority has a strong procedure in place to ensure that plans are developed through a robust assurance framework to enable such programmes to be justified to the government and Treasury.

The Chair observed that it takes a lot of work to create the business cases and to progress them through each stage of the quality assurance process. Low-interest retrofit loans, solar panels for community and school buildings, area-based demonstrator retrofit projects, and the development of local area energy planning are all part of the present programmes. Additionally, officers are still developing housing and battery storage initiatives in collaboration with the Yorkshire Housing Partnership.

The Chair noted that, at the last meeting of the Committee, members had agreed to a skills audit being undertaken to enable officers to identify areas in which knowledge upskilling could be offered. Eight responses from the Committee's members had been received to date. The Chair observed that while members already possess a great deal of depth and expertise, it is vital that the Committee identify relevant training opportunities.

Lastly, the Chair informed the Committee that in order to find solutions that involve the public, the Mayor of West Yorkshire and the five constituent authorities will be initiating a public conversation on climate change and the emergency response. The Mayor's Big Bus Chat will serve as the foundation for this effort, the Chair indicated, allowing for a conversation about attitudes and views that will be integrated into in-depth work over an appropriate period of time. The mayor and the leaders of the constituent authorities want to ensure that there are links to webpages about climate emergencies in each of the five council districts. This will then enable the districts and the Combined Authority to facilitate mutual signposting of their activity as a result.

6. Committee Governance

The Committee considered a report of the Director for Policing, Environment and Place which noted the co-opting of a representative of the NHS onto the Committee. It also updated the Committee on the new individuals who will be representing the Environment Agency and Yorkshire Water and sought feedback on the ways in which the views of young people could be sought and integrated into the work of the Committee and Combined Authority.

Officers introduced the report and explained that the Partnership Agreement between the Combined Authority and NHS West Yorkshire Integrated Care Board (ICB) sets out both organisations' shared commitment to work together on factors that affect population health, including climate change. Off the back of the Partnership Agreement, representatives from the ICB will be co-opted onto the Combined Authority's Place, Regeneration and Housing Committee.

The involvement of the NHS / ICB would enable the health outcomes from climate and environment actions to be captured in the Committee's work and to consider the NHS's own carbon footprint. At the Combined Authority

meeting held on 12 October 2023, Ian Holmes was appointed as the advisory representative from the NHS West Yorkshire Integrated Care Board to the Committee. Due to personnel changes, the Environment Agency will now be represented by Jenny Cooke, and Yorkshire Water by Adam Ashman.

As young people are the ones who will be impacted the most by a changing climate, the Combined Authority needs to involve young people in many areas, not just climate change and net zero.

Members made the following observations:

- A member stated that she thought the report included a good list of activities that would reach a significant number of young people. The member emphasised the need to be aware of what would happen after the engagement had taken place, and what would be done with the information gathered. The member stressed the importance of ensuring that the young people's voices had an impact and that feedback was provided to them about the developments.
- A member discussed the idea of reaching a broader audience through the Scouts, particularly at the squirrel level. He pointed out the opportunity to utilise the Scout network and leadership to engage with young people.
- The Environment Agency's presence at this meeting was appreciated by members. It was mentioned that their concerns extended beyond flooding, and there was a need for a broader understanding of what was the overall remit of Environment Agency.
- Members stressed the importance of researching the right methods of engagement. They suggested having some co-design on this and that it would be beneficial if the Mayor's conversation could specifically ask young people how they wanted the climate emergency to be addressed.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. That the Committee noted the appointment by the Combined Authority on 12th October, of an advisory representative from the NHS West Yorkshire Integrated Care Board to the Committee.
- iii. That the Committee noted the change in members representing the Environment Agency and Yorkshire Water on this Committee.
- iv. That the Committee reviewed and provided feedback on the potential methods for engaging with young people.

7. Monitoring Indicators

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Operating Officer, which provided a report to members on the State of the Region monitoring indicators pertaining to climate, energy, and the environment.

Officers introduced the report and explained that members receive regular reports on these indicators, reflecting the committee's efforts to improve outcomes. The State of the Region indicators give a high-level strategic picture of performance and will be detailed in the State of the Region 2023 report scheduled for publication in late-October.

The report also covered the energy efficiency of properties, premises at risk of flooding, access to greenspace, fuel poverty, and electric vehicle charging infrastructure in West Yorkshire.

Members made the following observations:

- A member mentioned that 91% of new builds had reached energy performance certificate (EPC) level C or above, with 9% not achieving this, which he found staggering. He suggested that this needed to be addressed.
- A member observed that the Combined Authority was using the same definition of fuel poverty as the government. Living in an EPC property or better meant that individuals were not classified as being in fuel poverty, regardless of their income situation. This was considered as lacking common sense, and it was noted that this skewed the statistics.
- In relation to distances travelled, a member suggested considering metrics like electric miles or zero carbon miles to help people understand their journeys in terms of environmental impact. In addition, he proposed looking into incentives to encourage companies to improve beyond an EPC level C rating, including them potentially earning recognition from the Combined Authority.
- A suggestion was made to create a dashboard to track the indicators for public awareness.
- A member referred to a recent National Grid event. He explained that the National Grid manage the transmission system across Great Britain. He emphasised the importance of electric vehicle charging, the connections for which was within the remit of the Northern Powergrid network. This had prompted discussions with the Combined Authority (CA) about the vital role of Local Area Energy Plans. The member observed that the local grid needs robust capacity to support future green electricity demands.
- A member expressed the value of datasets but raised concerns about charts that compared different authorities. He inquired about the

possibility of breaking down all data to the local authority level, similar to how energy efficiency was presented.

- A member asked if there were forward projections for targets and a plan for achieving them, particularly in terms of green energy in the region.
- A member raised questions about ensuring all greenhouse gases were considered as well as carbon. He also noted that transportation disruption due to flooding could lead to increased vehicle use and asked about strategies to prevent such escalation of climate change.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. That the Committee noted the headline analysis of the indicators.

8. Natural England's Work in the Region

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place which outlined the mutual interest between the Combined and Natural England and how this benefited the people of West Yorkshire.

Officers introduced the report which explained that Natural England is a government advisor for the natural environment in England. It is publicly funded to conserve, enhance and manage the natural environment.

West Yorkshire's Local Nature Recovery Strategy will be developed by the Combined Authority and published in 2025. It will help to build a national Nature Recovery Network across England. Natural England senior advisors are working closely with Combined Authority officers to produce and publish the Local Nature Recovery Strategy for West Yorkshire.

Oliver Harmar, Natural England's Chief Operating Officer, was then invited to address the Committee. He began his speech by expressing gratitude for the invitation and commending the Committee for addressing important social challenges. He noted that West Yorkshire was a leader in this regard and mentioned that he would discuss the Local Nature Strategy.

He highlighted that Natural England as an agency comes under the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA). They sit alongside other organisations in the form of the Environment Agency and the Forestry Commission. He noted that Natural England had recently experienced significant growth. They were seeking to address both the nature emergency and the climate emergency. He stressed the synergy between their national efforts and local initiatives.

He acknowledged the incredible natural environments in Yorkshire but emphasised the unequal access available for residents. He considered both the people and nature aspects as crucial. Natural England's mission was focused on building partnerships for nature recovery, requiring localised

collaborations. He mentioned the insufficiency of merely protecting existing natural areas and stated that Natural England's mission was to explore various tools to integrate the environment and nature into planning, particularly concerning landscapes and well-being. Environmental, health, and water considerations were also essential.

Paul Duncan discussed the Local Nature Recovery Strategy, where they played a facilitative role among fifty such strategies nationwide, stressing the need for a strategic plan. He referenced recent initiatives in Bradford involving the launch of six major nature recovery projects. These efforts aimed to work with local authorities to ensure access to high-quality greenspaces and develop a strategic plan for Local Biodiversity Net Gain. Oliver Harmar also touched on Natural England's efforts to combat water pollution through collaboration with farmers to achieve this goal.

Members made the following observations:

- A member enquired whether the mapping covers the entire region or individual projects. The Yorkshire Area Deputy Director for Natural England, Paul Duncan responded that the Nature Recovery Project focuses on individual projects rather than mapping the entire region.
- Members praised the presentation and stressed the importance of not neglecting areas outside the project, especially in Wakefield and Leeds, and called for projects in those areas.
- A member asked about the use of Section 106 money for biodiversity net gain and requested metrics to measure its effectiveness. He also asked if others could get involved in the West Yorkshire Strategy. Oliver Harmar committed to addressing the concerns about Section 106 and involving more stakeholders in the West Yorkshire Strategy.
- A member pointed out the policy tension between brownfield and greenfield development and the need to address neglected brownfield sites. Oliver Harmar committed to discussing the project and exploring ways to measure biodiversity with the member.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. That Committee noted the existing relationship between Natural England and the Combined Authority.
- iii. That Committee endorsed Natural England's approach to the future of this relationship, specifically around the immediate need to publish the first LNRS.

9. Mass Transit Sustainability Strategy

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Mass Transit which advised members on the development of the Sustainability Strategy for West Yorkshire Mass Transit, which aligns with national and regional legislation and policy, UN Sustainable Development Goals, and provides positive sustainability outcomes and commitments.

Officers introduced the report and explained that the strategy will guide the project through feasibility, development, delivery, and into operation, and will be consulted on with the public as part of the first phase options consultation. Measurable indicators and targets for the full outcome framework will be developed in parallel.

Members made the following observations:

- The Chair referred to the concept and models of mass transit in other parts of Europe to aid the strategy's conceptual and design phases.
- A member referred to the fact that the consultation document on bus franchising is complex, highlighting the need for public accessibility in our approach to future consultations. He also noted that the Combined Authority's progress in the sustainability accreditation area is good. The member enquired if it is possible to take up certain ISO standards in addition to greenhouse gas emissions along with sustainable procurement as well.
- A member asked about the government's involvement in the tram project in Leeds. The Chair responded by emphasising the importance of advocating for further infrastructure development in Yorkshire.
- A member asked whether the Mass Transit Strategy covers commuting out of the region, and officers clarified that the infrastructure will be in West Yorkshire but aims to attract patronage from outside the region.
- The Chair requested regular updates to the Committee on this item.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- i. That the Committee endorsed the approach proposed for the development of the Sustainability Strategy for the West Yorkshire Mass Transit, and the Direction of Travel regarding emerging sustainability objectives and priorities.
- ii. That the Committee endorsed the aspiration for the West Yorkshire Mass Transit project to be accredited to appropriate industry sustainability standards.

10. Better Homes Hub

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place which updated members on the Better Homes Hub programme.

Officers introduced the report and explained that the Better Homes Hub (BHH) is the regional programme of the Combined Authority to scale-up domestic retrofit, with a vision to create warm, comfortable, and low carbon homes for everyone in West Yorkshire. The programme has three objectives to build consensus on priorities for retrofitting, delivery of retrofit projects, and establishment of the BHH as a trusted entity for all residents. A consortium led by the Energy Saving Trust has been appointed as client-side support for the BHH programme, and they will provide expert advice and an evidence-base to drive decision-making.

The Energy Efficiency Carbon Reduction Framework has been approved for a 2-year period with the potential for a 2-year extension thereafter. The low-interest loan will be launched in March 2024 to help owner-occupiers and private landlords fund the retrofit of their homes, and it will be part of a menu of finance options. The report also covers the success of the Social Housing Decarbonisation Fund, the Leeds Retrofit Accelerator, and business cases related to the area-based schemes.

Members made the following observations:

- A member inquired about the details of the energy efficiency scheme and whether it included renewable energy. He expressed concerns about whether the loan available would cover the costs of retrofit. Officers explained that the scheme allows people to choose the measures they want based on their specific needs and circumstances.
- A member asked about the potential impact of government grants, specifically the £7,000 for heat pumps. Officers stated that there is no restriction on combining the scheme with government grants. There is a limit for landlords not to receive over £300,000 of state aid in three years.
- A member asked if the loan is interest-free and whether good practices would be encouraged to improve energy efficiency. Officers clarified that the loan has a 3.2% interest rate to allow low repayments and is unsecured with property title restrictions for recovery in case of sale.
- Members expressed concerns about the loan's affordability given the cost-of-living crisis and asked about the repayment period. They also enquired about other finance options alongside the loan and asked about mechanisms for ensuring loan repayment and the possibility of warranty schemes. Officers mentioned that the loan might not cover all needs but is being tested for viability and is focussed at the ability to pay market. They suggested signposting other less able to pay to local authorities for grants, mentioned a standard 10-year loan term,

and discussed innovative finance options like climate bonds. Officers expressed a willingness to discuss warranty schemes with members and emphasised the importance of ensuring quality and creating a trusted supplier list.

- A member expressed satisfaction with the progress of the region's first area-based scheme and mentioned the hope for insights from Innovate UK research projects.
- A member questioned the quality aspect of the installation and suggested support through a local trust or assurance program for improvement works.
- Members highlighted the challenges faced by small companies in the industry and the need to understand and support local businesses in the area.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. That the Committee provided feedback on the most suitable method for ensuring quality of install through the low interest loan while not placing a significant burden on residents.
- iii. That the Committee provided feedback on the mechanisms that could be implemented to ensure a seamless offer between the area-based schemes and the low interest loan.

11. Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Strategy

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Transport Policy and Delivery which provided members with an update on West Yorkshire's electric vehicle (EV) infrastructure strategy.

Officers introduced the report and explained that, in accordance with the government's goal of achieving net-zero emissions by 2050, the report highlighted the importance of establishing a reliable and accessible EV charging network. Currently, there are 841 publicly accessible chargepoints in the region, but coverage remains uneven, particularly in rural and lower-income areas. To address this, a draft strategy has been developed with several key principles, including expanding 'close to home' charging, reducing inequalities in access, ensuring affordability and usability, and promoting renewable energy use.

Additionally, the report discusses the Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure (LEVI) Programme, which aims to accelerate chargepoint delivery, especially in areas without off-street parking. West Yorkshire has received funding, including pilot and capability funding, with a potential total program value of over £17 million, including private investment. The report anticipates the delivery of 500-1000 chargepoints through this program, focusing on equity of access and social value. A final LEVI Capital scheme proposal is

expected in November 2023 to further enhance the region's EV infrastructure.

Members made the following observations:

- A member expressed endorsement for the direction of the charging infrastructure strategy. He emphasised the need to consider the management and distribution of charging infrastructure within the region, particularly in relation to monitoring indicators.
- A member raised concerns about the absence of information regarding workplace charging stations and their influence on the strategy. He suggested that hub charging might be a more suitable solution, especially in areas with limited on-street parking. He also emphasised the importance of appropriately sized spaces and accessibility for vehicles.
- A member discussed on-street charging and the perspective of people using cables from their homes. He pointed out that the paper did not address this. He highlighted the cost difference, with public charging being more expensive due to higher VAT on commercial energy supplies.
- The Chair noted the challenge of providing charging infrastructure in terrace housing streets, where individuals with mobility difficulties share the same space. She commended experiences in Scotland, particularly in Dundee, where community charging infrastructure within residential streets has been successful.

Resolved:

That the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee:

- i. Noted the contents of the report.
- ii. Noted the update on the EV infrastructure work being undertaken by the Combined Authority.

12. Air Quality

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Transport Policy and Delivery which provided an update on air quality activities and policies in West Yorkshire.

Officers introduced the report and explained that poor air quality is a significant issue, with approximately 1 in 20 deaths in the region attributed to it, costing the UK economy £16 billion annually. The West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy (WYLES), adopted in 2016, focuses on emissions from transport as a primary source of poor air quality. There are currently 36 Air Quality Management Areas and a Clean Air Zone in Bradford due to excessive nitrogen dioxide emissions from road traffic.

New legislation, like the Environment Act 2021, has set stricter air quality targets, emphasising particulate matter (PM2.5). A new air quality strategy is being developed to reflect these changes and the introduction of the Clean Air Zone in Bradford.

To better understand PM sources, the West Yorkshire Particulate Information Improvement Project (PIIP) is underway, funded by Defra. This project enhances monitoring networks, provides a particulate dashboard, and involves research from university partners. Consultants are also identifying non-transport PM sources. These efforts will inform the development of a comprehensive air quality strategy for West Yorkshire, supporting broader climate and environmental goals.

Members made the following observations:

- A member suggested considering the inclusion of particulate matter in Monitoring Indicators, which was generally supported. The Director of Policing, Environment and Place mentioned that the issue of including particulate matter in Monitoring Indicators would be discussed with the relevant officers.
- A member emphasised that electric vehicles (EVs) alone are not a complete solution for air quality problems. He called for innovative ways to provide alternative options and improve air quality, which could involve planting, biodiversity projects, and road use schemes.
- A member enquired about exploring other emission sources such as small particulates, domestic cooking, and indoor heating quality.
- A member asked about collaboration with the Clean Air Team at Bradford and how particulates might impact young people and children. The Born in Bradford study was mentioned as a useful source of data.
- A member questioned how to address particulates not under local control, like those from the national road network. He suggested cooperation with Highways England for tree planting and mentioned that other areas had seen speed restrictions to enhance air quality.
- A member raised a question about the scope of the work regarding indoor particulates, to which officers committed to finding out and reporting back.

Resolved:

That the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee:

- i. Noted the contents of the report.

- ii. Noted the regional air quality strategy work being undertaken by the Combined Authority and district partners.

13. Project Approvals

The Committee considered a report which summarised proposals for the progression of, and funding for projects under Investment Priority 4 – Tackling the Climate Emergency and Environmental Sustainability Investment within the West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS). The Climate, Energy and Environment Committee had delegated decision making authority approved by the Combined Authority on 23 June 2022 for the project.

The Net Zero Accelerator Programme

The Net Zero Accelerator programme aims to achieve the region's net zero commitments by implementing high-impact projects that address the climate emergency, restore nature, tackle air pollution, and create green jobs. The program is set to be completed by March 2024, but a change request is seeking further funding to extend the program for three years and incorporate learnings from its progress so far.

The scheme's success will establish the region as a leader in climate and environmental emergency response, making it an attractive place for businesses and individuals. The proposed change request includes revising the scheme's scope, increasing its total cost from £960,000 to £3,020,000, and extending its delivery timeframe from March 2024 to March 2027.

Members discussed the project and brought up the Huddersfield District Energy Network and highlighted the government's requirement for such schemes to incorporate Carbon Capture and Storage (CCS) technology. They noted the need to assess the viability of such projects, especially considering the potential return to gas as an energy source in 2037, while expressing support for the current scheme.

Resolved: The Climate, Energy and Environment Committee, subject to the conditions set by the Strategic Portfolio Office, approved the following:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. That the Committee approved the change request to revise the scope of the Net Zero Region Accelerator scheme, to change the total scheme costs from £960,000 to £3,020,000 and to extend the schemes delivery timeframe from March 2024 to March 2027.
 - i. That the Committee approved the Combined Authority's contribution of £3,020,000 is given. The total scheme value is £3,020,000.
 - ii. That the Committee endorsed the delegation for the approval for any future grant funding agreements and associated development funding required, in relation to the £3,020,000, was given to the Director of Policing, Environment and Place.

- iii. That future approvals are made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in the report. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in this report. Where required, any future committee level approvals are delegated to the Transport Committee.

14. Pledge Delivery Update

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place which provided an overview of the efforts being made to achieve the mayoral pledge of achieving net zero by 2038.

Officers introduced the report which covered various themes under which the West Yorkshire Climate and Environment Plan (CEP) operates. The CEP is a key document for the Combined Authority, and is linked to various policies, strategies, and plans guiding wide-ranging actions. It sets out an evidence base in the form of Carbon Emissions Reductions Pathways (the “Pathways”) and an associated action plan for the period 2021-2024.

The current Pathways have modelled interventions that would result in significant emissions reductions by 2038, but more ambitious measures or systems changes would be needed to reach net-zero. The region is now developing a “Complete Pathway” and a roadmap to demonstrate how net zero can be achieved by 2038.

Members made the following observations:

- A member expressed interest in the green skills topic, emphasising the importance of engaging with young people. She noted that in a video released for schools it featured only white men, which raised concerns about the equality implications. The Chair said this would be looked at.
- A member pointed out the need to address the gap between the stated ambitions for 2038 and the current progress. He mentioned that the figures indicated a 17 to 25% reduction in emissions. Officers explained that the pathways are crucial evidence for updating the Climate and Environment plan, which is set to run until 2024. They proposed considering consultations on the plan and asked if there were specific consultees that the members would like to engage with.
- Members enquired about the consideration of gas all emissions, to which officers confirmed that they were looking at CO₂e emission targets.

Resolved:

- i. That the Committee noted the contents of this report.
- ii. In respect of the update of the CEP, the Committee provided its views on the proposed period of the updated CEP, the proposed structure

and content of the CEP, and possible consultees for the development of the CEP.

15. Date of the Next Meeting

It was noted that the next meeting of the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee was scheduled to be held on 13 February 2024.